2004-2005 Supreme Court Preview: Contents

Institute of Bill of Rights Law at The College of William & Mary School of Law

Repository Citation
https://scholarship.law.wm.edu/preview/191

Copyright c 2004 by the authors. This article is brought to you by the William & Mary Law School Scholarship Repository.
https://scholarship.law.wm.edu/preview
SUPREME COURT PREVIEW

What to Expect From the New Term

October 22 & 23, 2004
2004-2005 Supreme Court Preview

INSTITUTE OF BILL OF RIGHTS LAW

The Institute of Bill of Rights Law was established at William & Mary in 1982 to support research and education on the Constitution and the Bill of Rights. One of the principal missions of the Institute is to facilitate interaction between the professions of law and journalism. Through a discussion of key cases on the Supreme Court’s docket at the start of each term, the annual Supreme Court Preview provides in-depth education for journalists on the underlying issues in order to enhance press coverage of the decisions.

STAFF

NEAL DEVINS, Goodrich Professor of Law, Director, Institute of Bill of Rights Law and Professor of Government

MELODY S. NICHOLS, Program Coordinator

ASSISTANT EDITORS

Stephen J Clarke  Jennifer H Lagerquist  Jeffrey B. Mead
Emily A Jones  Eric M Leppo  Marie F. Siesseger
Amanda L Kutz  Laura N Mangel  Emily L Tulli
Curtis G Carll  Aaron L Kimber
Casey L Ewart  Seth R Hansen
Svetlana Khvalina  Anna N. Schenker
2004-2005 Supreme Court Preview

Table of Contents

Schedule of Events xix
Who's Who on the Panels xx

I. MOOT COURT ARGUMENT: Roper v. Simmons

In This Section

New Case: 03-633 Roper v. Simmons

Synopsis and Question Presented 2

Court to Decide Young Killers' Fate; Justices to Rule on Executing Juveniles
Jan Crawford Greenburg 12

Death Penalty Information Center: Statistics 15

Jury Will Get Case of Drowning Death
Leo Fitzmaurice 18

Jurors Consider Death For Woman's Killer
Leo Fitzmaurice 19

Psychiatrists Question Death for Teen Killers
Paul Davies 20

Supreme Court Passes on Case of a Teen on Death Row;
Four Justices Have Called Execution of Young Killers "Shameful,"
But Have Yet to Press the Issue Further.
Anne Gearan 23

In Virginia, Convicts Find They're Not Too Young to Die;
Jury Spares Malvo, But Another Teen Killer Waits on Death Row
Reilly Capps 25
THE LAW UNDER GEORGE W. BUSH

II.

The War on Terror

High Court Says Detainees Have Right to Hearing
David Savage 31

War of Secrets: Judicial Restraint; The Imperial Presidency vs. The Imperial Court
Linda Greenhouse 35

Two Out of Three Ain’t Bad; Assessing the Supreme Court’s Detainee Rulings
Peter Berkowitz 38

No Blank Check
David Cole 41

Tribunals to Weigh Detainees’ Status: Setup is Response to Supreme Court Ruling on Rights
Charles Savage 43

By Flouting War Laws, US Invites Tragedy
Erwin Chemerinsky 45

Gitmo’ Better Blues
Neal Katyal 47

Memo Lists Acceptable ‘Aggressive’ Interrogation Methods
Toni Locy and John Diamond 50

A Crucial Look at Torture Law
John Yoo 52

Slim Legal Grounds for Torture Memos; Most Scholars Reject Broad View of Executive’s Power
R. Jeffrey Smith 54

A ‘Torture’ Memo and Its Tortuous Critics
Eric Posner and Adrian Vermeule 57

Bush Pushes for Renewal of Antiterrorism Legislation
Richard W. Stevenson and Eric Lichtblau 59

Repeal the Patriot Act
Andrew P. Napolitano 61
The Patriot Act Without Tears
Andrew C. McCarthy 63

Executive Privilege

Justices’ Ruling Postpones Resolution of Cheney Case
Linda Greenhouse 66

At the Court, Inflating the White House’s Power
Joan A. Lukey 69

Refusal to Testify Has Precedent
Charles Lane 72

Charlie McCarthy Hearings
Maureen Dowd 74

President’s Privilege: Why Bush Didn’t Want Condoleezza Rice to Testify
Before the September 11 Commission – and Why She’s Going to do so Today
Terry Eastland 76

Power Plays
Alexis Simendinger 78

The Social Conservative Agenda

A New Meaning for ‘Bully Pulpit’
Susan Jacoby 82

A Senator’s Call to ‘Win This Culture War’
David D. Kirkpatrick 84

Winning While Losing
Richard W. Stevenson 87

George W., Judicial Activist
Timothy Noah 89

The Politics of Piety; Bush’s Public Religiosity Connects with America – and
That Will Win Him Votes
Charlotte Allen 91

Look Left
Jonathan Chait 94
The Supreme Court as an Election Issue

Fighting Over the Court: It’s Tough to Make the Supreme Court into an Election Issue
William G. Ross 97

Bush’s Justice
Terry Eastland 100

Admit the Obvious: It’s a Political Process; Ideology Governs Judicial Confirmations. Let’s Say So
David Greenberg 103

Dismissed in Boston: Why Won’t the Democrats Talk About Judges?
Dahlia Lithwick 106

Appointments

The Right-Wing Assault; What’s at Stake, What’s Already Happened and What Could Yet Occur
Cass R. Sunstein 108

Remarks by the President During Federal Judicial Appointees Announcement
111

Stop the Madness; In the Judicial Nominations War, Do Unto Others as You Would Have Them Do Unto You.
Stuart Taylor Jr. 113

Checkmate in the Judges Game? For democracy’s sake, President Bush should threaten a recess appointment, or two.
Randolph J. May 116

Bush Bypasses Senate On Judge; Pickering Named To Appeals Court During Recess
Mike Allen and Helen Dewar 119

Statement on Appointment of William H. Pryor Jr.
122

Understudies
Clay Risen 123

Here’s What Less Experience Gets You
Michael J. Gerhardt 126
Activist, Schmactivist
Dahlia Lithwick
130

The Case of the Gradually Disappearing Supreme Court
Stuart Taylor Jr.
132

III. CIVIL RIGHTS

In This Section

New Case: 02-1672 Jackson v. Birmingham Board of Education

Synopsis and Question Presented

Justices Asked to Broaden Anti-Bias Law: High Court to Consider
Title IX Case that Would Ban Retaliation Against Those Who
Complain About Sexual Discrimination
Christine M. Garton
146

Gender Equity Case Heads to Top Court: Coach Claims
He Lost Job for Whistleblowing
Mary Orndorff
149

A Girl’s Team, a Fired Coach, Title IX
Warren Richey
150

High Court is Rolling Back Implied Private Rights of action:
The Court Refused to Review a Suit Based on a Law Requiring
Children’s Health Screenings
Steve France
152

New Case: 03-636 Johnson v. Gomez

Synopsis and Question Presented

Justices Agree to Evaluate Prison Policy Based On Race
Linda Greenhouse
163

Justices to Debate California’s Segregated Prison Policy
David G. Savage
165

U.S. Supreme Court to Review California Prison Cell Segregation
Anne Gearan
166
Syracuse U.: Syracuse Grad, Cell Mate Challenge Prison Housing
Erin Dejesus

New Case: 03-1160 Smith v. City of Jackson
Synopsis and Question Presented

Supreme Court to Consider Role of Intent in Age Bias
Linda Greenhouse

Being Unfair to the Gray-Haired
Marshall H. Tanick

Age Bias Lawsuits Likely to Skyrocket
George Brandon

Age Discrimination Hard to Prove, But Suits Likely to Grow
Dave Carpenter

New Case: 03-1395 Tenet v. Doe
Synopsis and Question Presented

Court to Review Spies' Right to Sue CIA Over Broken Vow
Walter Pincus

Lawsuit Could Affect Spy Recruitment
Mike Carter

Suspicious Behavior: The Ninth Circuit Lets Ex-Spies Sue the CIA
Robert Pambianco

Local Couple Sues, Says CIA Didn't Keep Cold War Promises
Mike Carter

New Case: 03-9659 Miller-El v. Dretke
Synopsis and Question Presented

Death Row Inmate Back at High Court: Is 5th Circuit Defying a Supreme Court Ruling?
Marcia Coyle

Batson Strikes Out in Miller-El Habeas Appeal
John Council
Death Row Inmate Loses Appeal Claiming Racism
Thomas Korosec 214

High Court Revisits Racial Bias in Jury Selection
Warren Richey 215

High Court Rules Inmate Deserves His Bias Hearing
Charles Lane 218

IV. INTERNATIONAL LAW

Use of Foreign Law in Domestic Jurisprudence

Opening Argument: Should Foreign Law Be Used to Interpret Our Constitution?
Stuart Taylor, Jr. 222

Don’t Gag U.S. Courts
Martha F. Davis 225

Thinking Outside the U.S.
Charles Lane 227

Foreign Exchange: Should the Supreme Court Care What Other Countries Think?
Tim Wu 229

Courting the World: U.S. Judges Must Overcome a Culture of Legal Isolationism—
Or Risk Being Left Behind
Anne-Marie Slaughter 232

Judicial Interpretation of the Law Based on Foreign Precedents
Statements to House Judiciary Subcommittee on Constitution
John O. McGinnis 234
Vicki C. Jackson 237

Remarks for the American Constitutional Society. Looking Beyond Our Borders:
The Value of a Comparative Perspective in Constitutional Adjudication
Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg 240

We Promised the World: Now President Bush Should Honor Our Treaty Obligations to Foreigners in U.S. Courts
Stuart Taylor, Jr. 242
The Alien Tort Claims Act

*Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain,*
*United States v. Alvarez-Machain* 247

*Human Rights Abuses Worldwide Are Held to Fall under U.S. Courts*
Linda Greenhouse 255

*The Court of Last Resort*
Arlen Specter 258

*Playing the Security Card*
David Cole 259

*Justices Open Door with Alien Tort Case; What Kind of Claims Remain is Contested*
Marcia Coyle 261

V. CRIMINAL PROCEDURE

**New Case: 04-104 U.S. v. Booker**

Synopsis and Question Presented 268

*Transcript of Sentencing Hearing in U.S. v. Fanfan (04-105)* 273

*Justices Agree to Consider Sentencing*
Lyle Denniston 275

*Justices, in Bitter 5-4 Split, Raise Doubts on Sentencing Guidelines*
Linda Greenhouse 277

*High Court Ruling Sows Confusion*
Joan Biskupic 280

*Long Term in Drug Case Fuels Debate on Sentencing*
Adam Liptak 283

*Justice By the Numbers*
Joan Biskupic and Mary Pat Flaherty 286

**New Case: 03-923 Illinois v. Caballes**

Synopsis and Question Presented 292
High Court Takes Police-Dog Case
Joan Biskupic

Supreme Court to Hear La Salle County Drug Case
Tom Collins

An Officer’s Best Buddy
Adriana Mateus

New Case: 03-674 Jama v. INS
Synopsis and Question Presented

New Case: 03-583 Leocal v. Ashcroft
Synopsis and Question Presented

Supreme Court Roundup: Justices Agree to Hear Two Deportation Cases
Linda Greenhouse

Miami-Dade Case Goes to High Court
Lisa Arthur

Immigration Case Creates Legal Stir
Todd Nelson

U.S. Gains Strength On Deportations: Supreme Court Says Legal Aliens Who Commit Certain Crimes Can Be Held Before Hearing on Removal
Tony Mauro

New Case: 03-931 Florida v. Nixon
Synopsis and Question Presented

Man Gets New Trial in ’84 Killing: Court Says Nixon Did Not Agree to Defense Strategy
James L. Rosica

High Court to Review Slaying: Tallahassee case Tests Rules for Defense Lawyers
Tallahassee Democrat Staff

The Defense Wishes to Rest: Lawyers Avoid ‘Hassle’ of Death Penalty
Stephanie Saul

New Trial Revives Old Nightmares: Court’s Decision Shocks Jurors from 1985 Case
James L. Rosica
New Case: 03-0878 Crawford v. Martinez

Synopsis and Question Presented 334

New Case: 03-7434 Benitez v. Wallis

Synopsis and Question Presented 335

High Court to Decide Fate of Refugee; Daniel Benitez, a Mariel Refugee in Indefinite Detention, Wants the U.S. Supreme Court To Order His Release
Alfonso Chardy 339

High Court to Consider Detention Case; Justices to Decide if U.S. Can Indefinitely Imprison Illegal Immigrants
Charles Lane 342

Mariel Felons Remain Stuck in Legal Limbo
Alfonso Chardy 344

New Case: 03-1039 Goughnour v. Payton

Synopsis and Question Presented 347

California Death Penalty Law at Issue
David G. Savage 354

Legal Pingpong and a Condemned Man
Jerry Hicks 355

En Banc Ninth Circuit Again Orders New Death Penalty Trial for Killer
MetNews Staff Writer 359

With a 6-5 Split, Ninth Circuit Treads Familiar Ground
Jason Hoppin 361

VI. FEDERALISM

New Cases: 03-1116 Granholm v. Heald

Synopsis and Question Presented 365

New Case: 03-1274 Swedenburg v. Kelly

Synopsis and Question Presented 372
Justices to Review Issue of Shipping Alcohol Interstate
Robert S. Greenberger 380

Top court to rule on winery shipping; Small vintners seek end to ban on direct out-of-state sales
Carol Emert 381

Justices Step Into Interstate Wine Rift
Linda Greenhouse 384

The Wine Shipping News
David Shaw 386

Time to Sober Up; The Constitution does let states stop cross-border alcohol sales
Brannon P. Denning 388

New Case: 03-1454 Ashcroft v. Raich

Synopsis and Question Presented 391

Medical Marijuana to Get Justices’ Review
David G. Savage 400

Court will hear medical pot appeal; U.S. seeking to overturn state law upheld by appeals court
Bob Egelko, Patrick Hoge 402

Justice Set Back Use of Marijuana to Treat Sickness
Linda Greenhouse 404

Voters Approve Measure to Use Pot as Medicine
John Balzar 406

New Case: 03-388 Bates v. Dow Agrosciences

Synopsis and Question Presented 409

Supreme Court to consider FIFRA tort preemption
Maureen Conley 415

The Supreme Court Term That Was and the One That Will Be
Michael S. Greve 417
The Rehnquist Court Federalism Revival: A Status Report

Pulling Its Punches; The Court took on big issues but rendered few big decisions
Tony Mauro 420

The Court’s Faux Federalism
Ramesh Ponnuru 422

What Brown Teaches Us About the Rehnquist Court’s Federalism Revival
Neal Devins 426

He’ll Look Better When He’s Gone
Simon Lazarus 428

Steady Rationale at Court Despite Apparent Bend
Linda Greenhouse 431

The Supreme Court v. Balance of Powers
Larry D. Kramer 434

VII. BUSINESS LAW

New Case: 03-0184 Ballard v. CIR
Synopsis and Question Presented 439

New Case: 03-1034 Kanter v. CIR 444

Tax Court Secrecy Under Fire at High Court Justices Must Decide Whether to Take Up Case That Centers Around Tax Court Reporters Currently Kept Under Wraps
Marcia Coyle 449

Justices to Review Tax Court Secrecy; At Issue is Whether Taxpayers in Big Disputes Are Getting Fair Trials When Legal Findings Are Kept From Them
Associated Press 453

New Case: 03-0932 Dura Pharmaceuticals v. Broudo
Synopsis and Question Presented 454

Supreme Court Ruling Could Hit Fraud Lawsuit Claims
Adrian Michaels 460

Jonathan Birchall 461
Corporate Securities: Causation and Analysis
John C. Coffee 463

**New Case:** 03-0377 *Koons Buick v. Nigh*

Synopsis and Question Presented 467

*In re: Michael B. Price; Christine R. Price, Debtors/Appellants v. Delaware State Police Federal Credit Union, U.S. Trustee, 370 F.3d 362 (3d Cir. 2004)* 476

*High Court to Consider on Caps on Penalties Set by Lending Act*
Robert S. Greenberger 477

*Seeking Truth in Car Loans*
Associated Press 478

*Tricks Add Plenty to Car Costs*
Robert K. Heady 479

**New Case:** 03-1164 *Veneman v. Livestock Marketing/ 03-1165 Nebraska Cattlemen v. Livestock Marketing*

Synopsis and Question Presented 481

*Where's the Beef? Heading for the Supreme Court*
Linda Greenhouse 489

*Judge Rules Against Fees for Beef Marketing Courts: Government is Ordered to Stop Collecting Funds From Farmers for Research and Promotion Campaigns*
Bloomberg News 490

*Sizzle, Steak and Lawsuits: Supreme Court to Hear California Beef Ad Case With Wide Implications*
Tom Abate 491

*U.S. Court Rejects Mandatory Levy on Dairy Farmers*
Scott Kilman 493

**Looking Ahead:** *Prometheus Radio Project v. Federal Communications Commission*

Synopsis and Question Presented 494

*Court Backs Cross-Ownership Ban*
James P. Miller 500
In Media Decision, the Little Guys Lost.
Sallie Hoffmeister

Powell Calls Rejection of Media Rules a Disappointment
Frank Ahrens

Rewriting the Rules; FCC Relaxes Limits on Media Ownership
Edmund Sanders and Jube Shiver Jr.

Senate Votes to Block FCC Media Rules
Frank Ahrens

Looking Ahead: Punitive Damages; State Farm Insurance v. Campbell

Insurers Urge U.S. Supreme Court to Change Utah Ruling in Landmark Punitive Damages Case

Justices Limit Punitive Damages in Victory for Tort Revision
Linda Greenhouse

High Court Orders New Look at Punitive Award; Philip Morris Had Faced $79.5 Million Judgment
Edward Walsh

VIII. LOOKING AHEAD

Looking Ahead: The Ten Commandments; Van Orden v. Perry

Synopsis and Question Presented

Looking Ahead: The Ten Commandments; Johnson v. Baker

Synopsis and Question Presented

A Most Unusual Lawyer: A Homeless Man with Psychological Scars is Challenging Texas Over a Ten Commandments Statue. The Supreme Court May Take His Case.
Scott Gold

Two Tablets May Renew A High Court Headache; Disputes in Alabama, Other States Prompt Call For Supreme Court to Issue Definitive Ruling
Manuel Roig-Franzia

Federal Appeals Court Rules Against Ky. Ten Commandments Display
Turmoil In Adams County: Religious Displays Taken From Schools
Randy Ludlow 542

Debate Lingers As Monument is Removed From View; Commandments Display Put in Storage in Ala. Courthouse
Alan Cooperman & Manuel Roig-Franzia 545

Alabama Justice's Ouster Upheld in Ten Commandments Case
Ariel Hart 547

Looking Ahead: Felony Voting Rights; Muntaqim v. Coombe
Synopsis and Question Presented 548

Disenfranchised Without Recourse?
Gary Young 553

Felony Disenfranchisement Laws in the United States
The Sentencing Project 555

Once a Felon, Never a Voter?
Megan Twohey 558

Votes For Felons
John J. Miller 562

Restoring Felons' Voting Rights A Heated Election-Year Issue in Florida
Chicago Tribune Staff 565

Looking Ahead: Freedom of Religion for Prison Inmates; Bass v. Madison
Synopsis and Question Presented 568

Zoning Gets Religious
David L. Hudson, Jr. 575

Lawsuit May Force Change in Prison Ban on Beards
Richard Fausset 577

Congressional Record (S6687-S6689) 580
The Law of Prisons: In the Belly of the Whale: Religious Practice in Prison 583

Federalism and Federal Spending: Why RLUIPA is Unconstitutional
Gregory S. Walston 587

Looking Ahead: Internet Piracy and User Privacy; Recording Industry of America v. Verizon

Synopsis and Question Presented 589

Recording Industry Curbed on Music Suits
Jonathan Krim and Frank Ahrens 594

Music Industry's Move Against Swappers Hits a Snag Just as Impact Takes Hold
Ethan Smith 597

Piracy Has Its Hooks In
Edna Gundersen 600

Music Industry Spins Falsehood
Janis Ian 605

Looking Ahead: Oregon Death with Dignity Act; Oregon v. Ashcroft

Synopsis and Question Presented 607

Ashcroft Attacks Oregon's Suicide Law
Josh Meyer and Kim Murphy 615

Court Rejects Ashcroft; Backs Suicide Law
Henry Weinstein 618

Euthanizing the CSA
Wesley J. Smith 621

In Oregon, Choosing Death Over Suffering
John Schwartz and James Estrin 623

Suicidal Folly
Jonathan H. Adler 626

Why Ashcroft is Wrong on Assisted Suicide
Nelson Lund 629
Looking Ahead: The Defense of Marriage Act

Law Backing Two-Sex Marriage Is Upheld by Federal Judge
Adam Liptak 631

Marriage Act Is Upheld In Pair’s Bankruptcy
Maureen O’Hagan 633

Bush Has the Wrong Remedy to Court-Imposed Gay Marriage
Stuart Taylor, Jr. 635

Supreme Court Paved Way for Marriage Ruling With Sodomy Law Decision
Linda Greenhouse 638

States’ Recognition of Same-Sex Unions May Be Tested
Charles Lane 640

Leave Marriage to the States
Bob Barr 642

Looking Ahead: Federal Ban on Partial Birth Abortion;

Court Rules That Governments Can’t Outlaw Type of Abortion
Linda Greenhouse 644

Senate Passes Ban on Abortion Procedure; Bush Set to Sign Bill; Poes Plan Court Fight
Helen Dewar 647

Partial-birth Ban Debated in Court
Amy Fagan 649

Next on Abortion: Supreme Collision
Simon Lazarus 651

U.S. Judge in San Francisco Strikes Down Federal Law Banning Form of Abortion
Adam Liptak 654

U.S. Court in New York Rejects Partial-Birth Abortion Ban
Julia Preston 657

IX. MISCELLANEOUS

Also This Term: Other Cases from the 2003-2004 Term
Synopses and Questions Presented 660

Reflections at the End of the 2003-2004 Term

The Year Rehnquist May Have Lost His Court
Linda Greenhouse 673

All Hail the Supreme Court; The Nine Justices Agree That They Know What Is Best
Stuart Taylor, Jr. 677

Off the Bench
Dahlia Lithwick 680

O'Connor Not Confined by Conservatism
Joan Biskupic 682