2004-2005 Supreme Court Preview: Contents

Institute of Bill of Rights Law at the William & Mary Law School

Repository Citation
https://scholarship.law.wm.edu/preview/191

Copyright c 2004 by the authors. This article is brought to you by the William & Mary Law School Scholarship Repository.
https://scholarship.law.wm.edu/preview
What to Expect
From the New Term
October 22 & 23, 2004
2004-2005 Supreme Court Preview
INSTITUTE OF BILL OF RIGHTS LAW

The Institute of Bill of Rights Law was established at William & Mary in 1982 to support research and education on the Constitution and the Bill of Rights. One of the principal missions of the Institute is to facilitate interaction between the professions of law and journalism. Through a discussion of key cases on the Supreme Court’s docket at the start of each term, the annual Supreme Court Preview provides in-depth education for journalists on the underlying issues in order to enhance press coverage of the decisions.

Staff

Neal Devins, Goodrich Professor of Law, Director, Institute of Bill of Rights Law and Professor of Government

Melody S. Nichols, Program Coordinator

Assistant Editors

Stephen J Clarke  Jennifer H Lagerquist  Jeffrey B. Mead
Emily A Jones  Eric M Leppo  Marie E Siesseger
Amanda L Kutz  Laura N Mangel  Emily L Tulli

Curtis G Carl  Aaron L Kimber
Casey L Ewart  Seth R Hansen

Svetlana Khvalina  Anna N. Schenker

The Institute of Bill of Rights Law

William & Mary School of Law
Williamsburg, Virginia 23187-8795
(757) 221-3810 • Fax (757) 221-3775
E-Mail: IBRL@wm.edu • Web: IBRL.org
2004-2005 Supreme Court Preview

Table of Contents

Schedule of Events xix

Who's Who on the Panels xx

I. MOOT COURT ARGUMENT: Roper v. Simmons

In This Section

New Case: 03-633 Roper v. Simmons

Synopsis and Question Presented 2

Court to Decide Young Killers' Fate; Justices to Rule on Executing Juveniles
Jan Crawford Greenburg 12

Death Penalty Information Center: Statistics 15

Jury Will Get Case of Drowning Death
Leo Fitzmaurice 18

Jurors Consider Death For Woman's Killer
Leo Fitzmaurice 19

Psychiatrists Question Death for Teen Killers
Paul Davies 20

Supreme Court Passes on Case of a Teen on Death Row;
Four Justices Have Called Execution of Young Killers "Shameful,"
But Have Yet to Press the Issue Further.
Anne Gearan 23

In Virginia, Convicts Find They're Not Too Young to Die;
Jury Spares Malvo, But Another Teen Killer Waits on Death Row
Reilly Capps 25
II. THE LAW UNDER GEORGE W. BUSH

The War on Terror

*High Court Says Detainees Have Right to Hearing*
David Savage 31

*War of Secrets: Judicial Restraint; The Imperial Presidency vs. The Imperial Court*
Linda Greenhouse 35

*Two Out of Three Ain’t Bad; Assessing the Supreme Court’s Detainee Rulings*
Peter Berkowitz 38

*No Blank Check*
David Cole 41

*Tribunals to Weigh Detainees’ Status: Setup is Response to Supreme Court Ruling on Rights*
Charles Savage 43

*By Flouting War Laws, US Invites Tragedy*
Erwin Chemerinsky 45

*Gitmo’ Better Blues*
Neal Katyal 47

*Memo Lists Acceptable ‘Aggressive’ Interrogation Methods*
Toni Locy and John Diamond 50

*A Crucial Look at Torture Law*
John Yoo 52

*Slim Legal Grounds for Torture Memos; Most Scholars Reject Broad View of Executive’s Power*
R. Jeffrey Smith 54

*A ‘Torture’ Memo and Its Tortuous Critics*
Eric Posner and Adrian Vermeule 57

*Bush Pushes for Renewal of Antiterrorism Legislation*
Richard W. Stevenson and Eric Lichtblau 59

*Repeal the Patriot Act*
Andrew P. Napolitano 61
The Patriot Act Without Tears
Andrew C. McCarthy  63

Executive Privilege

Justices’ Ruling Postpones Resolution of Cheney Case
Linda Greenhouse  66

At the Court, Inflating the White House’s Power
Joan A. Lukey  69

Refusal to Testify Has Precedent
Charles Lane  72

Charlie McCarthy Hearings
Maureen Dowd  74

President’s Privilege; Why Bush Didn’t Want Condoleeza Rice to Testify Before the September 11 Commission – and Why She’s Going to do so Today
Terry Eastland  76

Power Plays
Alexis Simendinger  78

The Social Conservative Agenda

A New Meaning for ‘Bully Pulpit’
Susan Jacoby  82

A Senator’s Call to ‘Win This Culture War’
David D. Kirkpatrick  84

Winning While Losing
Richard W. Stevenson  87

George W., Judicial Activist
Timothy Noah  89

The Politics of Piety; Bush’s Public Religiosity Connects with America – and That Will Win Him Votes
Charlotte Allen  91

Look Left
Jonathan Chait  94
The Supreme Court as an Election Issue

Fighting Over the Court: It’s Tough to Make the Supreme Court into an Election Issue
William G. Ross

Bush’s Justice
Terry Eastland

Admit the Obvious: It’s a Political Process; Ideology Governs Judicial Confirmations. Let’s Say So
David Greenberg

Dismissed in Boston: Why Won’t the Democrats Talk About Judges?
Dahlia Lithwick

Appointments

The Right-Wing Assault; What’s at Stake, What’s Already Happened and What Could Yet Occur
Cass R. Sunstein

Remarks by the President During Federal Judicial Appointees Announcement

Stop the Madness; In the Judicial Nominations War, Do Unto Others as You Would Have Them Do Unto You.
Stuart Taylor Jr.

Checkmate in the Judges Game? For democracy’s sake, President Bush should threaten a recess appointment, or two.
Randolph J. May

Bush Bypasses Senate On Judge; Pickering Named To Appeals Court During Recess
Mike Allen and Helen Dewar

Statement on Appointment of William H. Pryor Jr.

Understudies
Clay Risen

Here’s What Less Experience Gets You
Michael J. Gerhardt
III. CIVIL RIGHTS

**New Case:** 02-1672 *Jackson v. Birmingham Board of Education*

Synopsis and Question Presented

*Justices Asked to Broaden Anti-Bias Law: High Court to Consider Title IX Case that Would Ban Retaliation Against Those Who Complain About Sexual Discrimination*
Christine M. Garton

*Gender Equity Case Heads to Top Court: Coach Claims He Lost Job for Whistleblowing*
Mary Orndorff

*A Girl's Team, a Fired Coach, Title IX*
Warren Richey

*High Court is Rolling Back Implied Private Rights of action: The Court Refused to Review a Suit Based on a Law Requiring Children's Health Screenings*
Steve France

**New Case:** 03-636 *Johnson v. Gomez*

Synopsis and Question Presented

*Justices Agree to Evaluate Prison Policy Based On Race*
Linda Greenhouse

*Justices to Debate California's Segregated Prison Policy*
David G. Savage

*U.S. Supreme Court to Review California Prison Cell Segregation*
Anne Gearan
Syracuse U.: Syracuse Grad, Cell Mate Challenge Prison Housing
Erin Dejesus

New Case: 03-1160 Smith v. City of Jackson
Synopsis and Question Presented
Supreme Court to Consider Role of Intent in Age Bias
Linda Greenhouse

Being Unfair to the Gray-Haired
Marshall H. Tanick

Age Bias Lawsuits Likely to Skyrocket
George Brandon

Age Discrimination Hard to Prove, But Suits Likely to Grow
Dave Carpenter

New Case: 03-1395 Tenet v. Doe
Synopsis and Question Presented
Court to Review Spies' Right to Sue CIA Over Broken Vow
Walter Pincus

Lawsuit Could Affect Spy Recruitment
Mike Carter

Suspicious Behavior: The Ninth Circuit Lets Ex-Spies Sue the CIA
Robert Pambianco

Local Couple Sues, Says CIA Didn't Keep Cold War Promises
Mike Carter

New Case: 03-9659 Miller-El v. Dretke
Synopsis and Question Presented
Death Row Inmate Back at High Court: Is 5th Circuit Defying a Supreme Court Ruling?
Marcia Coyle

Batson Strikes Out in Miller-El Habeas Appeal
John Council
Death Row Inmate Loses Appeal Claiming Racism  
Thomas Korosec  

High Court Revisits Racial Bias in Jury Selection  
Warren Richey  

High Court Rules Inmate Deserves His Bias Hearing  
Charles Lane  

IV. INTERNATIONAL LAW

Use of Foreign Law in Domestic Jurisprudence

Opening Argument: Should Foreign Law Be Used to Interpret Our Constitution?  
Stuart Taylor, Jr.  

Don’t Gag U.S. Courts  
Martha F. Davis  

Thinking Outside the U.S.  
Charles Lane  

Foreign Exchange: Should the Supreme Court Care What Other Countries Think?  
Tim Wu  

Courting the World: U.S. Judges Must Overcome a Culture of Legal Isolationism—Or Risk Being Left Behind  
Anne-Marie Slaughter  

Judicial Interpretation of the Law Based on Foreign Precedents  
Statements to House Judiciary Subcommittee on Constitution  
John O. McGinnis  
Vicki C. Jackson  

Remarks for the American Constitutional Society. Looking Beyond Our Borders: The Value of a Comparative Perspective in Constitutional Adjudication  
Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg  

We Promised the World; Now President Bush Should Honor Our Treaty Obligations to Foreigners in U.S. Courts  
Stuart Taylor, Jr.
The Alien Tort Claims Act

Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain,
United States v. Alvarez-Machain 247

Human Rights Abuses Worldwide Are Held to Fall under U.S. Courts
Linda Greenhouse 255

The Court of Last Resort
Arlen Specter 258

Playing the Security Card
David Cole 259

Justices Open Door with Alien Tort Case; What Kind of Claims Remain is Contested
Marcia Coyle 261

V. CRIMINAL PROCEDURE

New Case: 04-104 U.S. v. Booker

Synopsis and Question Presented 268

Transcript of Sentencing Hearing in U.S. v. Fanfan (04-105) 273

Justices Agree to Consider Sentencing
Lyle Denniston 275

Justices, in Bitter 5-4 Split, Raise Doubts on Sentencing Guidelines
Linda Greenhouse 277

High Court Ruling Sows Confusion
Joan Biskupic 280

Long Term in Drug Case Fuels Debate on Sentencing
Adam Liptak 283

Justice By the Numbers
Joan Biskupic and Mary Pat Flaherty 286

New Case: 03-923 Illinois v. Caballes

Synopsis and Question Presented 292
High Court Takes Police-Dog Case
Joan Biskupic 297

Supreme Court to Hear La Salle County Drug Case
Tom Collins 299

An Officer's Best Buddy
Adriana Mateus 301

New Case: 03-674 Jama v. INS
Synopsis and Question Presented 304

New Case: 03-583 Leocal v. Ashcroft
Synopsis and Question Presented 310

Supreme Court Roundup: Justices Agree to Hear Two Deportation Cases
Linda Greenhouse 312

Miami-Dade Case Goes to High Court
Lisa Arthur 314

Immigration Case Creates Legal Stir
Todd Nelson 315

U.S. Gains Strength On Deportations: Supreme Court Says Legal Aliens Who Commit Certain Crimes Can Be Held Before Hearing on Removal
Tony Mauro 317

New Case: 03-931 Florida v. Nixon
Synopsis and Question Presented 319

Man Gets New Trial in '84 Killing: Court Says Nixon Did Not Agree to Defense Strategy
James L. Rosica 327

High Court to Review Slaying: Tallahassee case Tests Rules for Defense Lawyers
Tallahassee Democrat Staff 329

The Defense Wishes to Rest: Lawyers Avoid 'Hassle' of Death Penalty
Stephanie Saul 330

New Trial Revives Old Nightmares: Court's Decision Shocks Jurors from 1985 Case
James L. Rosica 332
New Case: 03-0878 Crawford v. Martinez
Synopsis and Question Presented

New Case: 03-7434 Benitez v. Wallis
Synopsis and Question Presented

High Court to Decide Fate of Refugee; Daniel Benitez, a Mariel Refugee in Indefinite Detention, Wants the U.S. Supreme Court To Order His Release
Alfonso Chardy

High Court to Consider Detention Case; Justices to Decide if U.S. Can Indefinitely Imprison Illegal Immigrants
Charles Lane

Mariel Felons Remain Stuck in Legal Limbo
Alfonso Chardy

New Case: 03-1039 Goughnour v. Payton
Synopsis and Question Presented

California Death Penalty Law at Issue
David G. Savage

Legal Pingpong and a Condemned Man
Jerry Hicks

En Banc Ninth Circuit Again Orders New Death Penalty Trial for Killer
MetNews Staff Writer

With a 6-5 Split, Ninth Circuit Treads Familiar Ground
Jason Hoppin

VI. FEDERALISM

New Cases: 03-1116 Granholm v. Heald
Synopsis and Question Presented

New Case: 03-1274 Swedenburg v. Kelly
Synopsis and Question Presented
Justices to Review Issue of Shipping Alcohol Interstate
Robert S. Greenberger 380

Top court to rule on winery shipping; Small vintners seek end to ban on direct out-of-state sales
Carol Emert 381

Justices Step Into Interstate Wine Rift
Linda Greenhouse 384

The Wine Shipping News
David Shaw 386

Time to Sober Up; The Constitution does let states stop cross-border alcohol sales
Brannon P. Denning 388

New Case: 03-1454 Ashcroft v. Raich

Synopsis and Question Presented 391

Medical Marijuana to Get Justices’ Review
David G. Savage 400

Court will hear medical pot appeal; U.S. seeking to overturn state law upheld by appeals court
Bob Egelko, Patrick Hoge 402

Justice Set Back Use of Marijuana to Treat Sickness
Linda Greenhouse 404

Voters Approve Measure to Use Pot as Medicine
John Balzar 406

New Case: 03-388 Bates v. Dow Agrosciences

Synopsis and Question Presented 409

Supreme Court to consider FIFRA tort preemption
Maureen Conley 415

The Supreme Court Term That Was and the One That Will Be
Michael S. Greve 417
The Rehnquist Court Federalism Revival: A Status Report

Pulling Its Punches; The Court took on big issues but rendered few big decisions
Tony Mauro 420

The Court's Faux Federalism
Ramesh Ponnuru 422

What Brown Teaches Us About the Rehnquist Court’s Federalism Revival
Neal Devins 426

He'll Look Better When He's Gone
Simon Lazarus 428

Steady Rationale at Court Despite Apparent Bend
Linda Greenhouse 431

The Supreme Court v. Balance of Powers
Larry D. Kramer 434

VII. BUSINESS LAW

New Case: 03-0184 Ballard v. CIR
Synopsis and Question Presented 439

New Case: 03-1034 Kanter v. CIR 444

Tax Court Secrecy Under Fire at High Court Justices Must Decide Whether to Take Up Case That Centers Around Tax Court Reporters Currently Kept Under Wraps
Marcia Coyle 449

Justices to Review Tax Court Secrecy; At Issue is Whether Taxpayers in Big Disputes Are Getting Fair Trials When Legal Findings Are Kept From Them Associated Press 453

New Case: 03-0932 Dura Pharmaceuticals v. Broudo
Synopsis and Question Presented 454

Supreme Court Ruling Could Hit Fraud Lawsuit Claims
Adrian Michaels 460

Corporate Securities: Causation and Analysis
John C. Coffee

New Case: 03-0377 Koons Buick v. Nigh

Synopsis and Question Presented


High Court to Consider on Caps on Penalties Set by Lending Act
Robert S. Greenberger

Seeking Truth in Car Loans
Associated Press

Tricks Add Plenty to Car Costs
Robert K. Heady

New Case: 03-1164 Veneman v. Livestock Marketing/ 03-1165 Nebraska Cattlemen v. Livestock Marketing

Synopsis and Question Presented

Where's the Beef? Heading for the Supreme Court
Linda Greenhouse

Judge Rules Against Fees for Beef Marketing Courts: Government is Ordered to Stop Collecting Funds From Farmers for Research and Promotion Campaigns
Bloomberg News

Sizzle, Steak and Lawsuits; Supreme Court to Hear California Beef Ad Case With Wide Implications
Tom Abate

U.S. Court Rejects Mandatory Levy on Dairy Farmers
Scott Kilman

Looking Ahead: Prometheus Radio Project v. Federal Communications Commission

Synopsis and Question Presented

Court Backs Cross-Ownership Ban
James P. Miller
In Media Decision, the Little Guys Lost
Sallie Hoffmeister 501

Powell Calls Rejection of Media Rules a Disappointment
Frank Ahrens 503

Rewriting the Rules; FCC Relaxes Limits on Media Ownership
Edmund Sanders and Jube Shiver Jr. 506

Senate Votes to Block FCC Media Rules
Frank Ahrens 511

Looking Ahead: Punitive Damages; State Farm Insurance v. Campbell

Insurers Urge U.S. Supreme Court to Change Utah Ruling in Landmark Punitive Damages Case 514

Justices Limit Punitive Damages in Victory for Tort Revision
Linda Greenhouse 515

High Court Orders New Look at Punitive Award; Philip Morris Had Faced $79.5 Million Judgment
Edward Walsh 517

VIII. LOOKING AHEAD

Looking Ahead: The Ten Commandments; Van Orden v. Perry
Synopsis and Question Presented 523

Looking Ahead: The Ten Commandments; Johnson v. Baker
Synopsis and Question Presented 528

A Most Unusual Lawyer; A Homeless Man with Psychological Scars is Challenging Texas Over a Ten Commandments Statute. The Supreme Court May Take His Case.
Scott Gold 532

Two Tablets May Renew A High Court Headache; Disputes in Alabama, Other States Prompt Call For Supreme Court to Issue Definitive Ruling
Manuel Roig-Franzia 537

Federal Appeals Court Rules Against Ky. Ten Commandments Display 540
Turmoil In Adams County: Religious Displays Taken From Schools  
Randy Ludlow  
542

Debate Lingers As Monument is Removed From View; Commandments Display Put in Storage in Ala. Courthouse  
Alan Cooperman & Manuel Roig-Franzia  
545

Alabama Justice's Ouster Upheld in Ten Commandments Case  
Ariel Hart  
547

Looking Ahead: Felony Voting Rights; Muntaqim v. Coombe  
Synopsis and Question Presented  
548

Disenfranchised Without Recourse?  
Gary Young  
553

Felony Disenfranchisement Laws in the United States  
The Sentencing Project  
555

Once a Felon, Never a Voter?  
Megan Twohey  
558

Votes For Felons  
John J. Miller  
562

Restoring Felons' Voting Rights A Heated Election-Year Issue in Florida  
Chicago Tribune Staff  
565

Looking Ahead: Freedom of Religion for Prison Inmates; Bass v. Madison  
Synopsis and Question Presented  
568

Zoning Gets Religious  
David L. Hudson, Jr.  
575

Lawsuit May Force Change in Prison Ban on Beards  
Richard Fausset  
577

Congressional Record (S6687-S6689)  
580
The Law of Prisons: In the Belly of the Whale: Religious Practice in Prison 583

Federalism and Federal Spending: Why RLUIPA is Unconstitutional
Gregory S. Walston 587

Looking Ahead: Internet Piracy and User Privacy; Recording Industry of America v. Verizon

Synopsis and Question Presented 589

Recording Industry Curbed on Music Suits
Jonathan Krim and Frank Ahrens 594

Music Industry’s Move Against Swappers Hits a Snag Just as Impact Takes Hold
Ethan Smith 597

Piracy Has Its Hooks In
Edna Gundersen 600

Music Industry Spins Falsehood
Janis Ian 605

Looking Ahead: Oregon Death with Dignity Act; Oregon v. Ashcroft

Synopsis and Question Presented 607

Ashcroft Attacks Oregon’s Suicide Law
Josh Meyer and Kim Murphy 615

Court Rejects Ashcroft; Backs Suicide Law
Henry Weinstein 618

Euthanizing the CSA
Wesley J. Smith 621

In Oregon, Choosing Death Over Suffering
John Schwartz and James Estrin 623

Suicidal Folly
Jonathan H. Adler 626

Why Ashcroft is Wrong on Assisted Suicide
Nelson Lund 629
Looking Ahead: The Defense of Marriage Act

Law Backing Two-Sex Marriage Is Upheld by Federal Judge
Adam Liptak 631

Marriage Act Is Upheld In Pair's Bankruptcy
Maureen O'Hagan 633

Bush Has the Wrong Remedy to Court-Imposed Gay Marriage
Stuart Taylor, Jr. 635

Supreme Court Paved Way for Marriage Ruling With Sodomy Law Decision
Linda Greenhouse 638

States' Recognition of Same-Sex Unions May Be Tested
Charles Lane 640

Leave Marriage to the States
Bob Barr 642

Looking Ahead: Federal Ban on Partial Birth Abortion;

Court Rules That Governments Can't Outlaw Type of Abortion
Linda Greenhouse 644

Senate Passes Ban on Abortion Procedure; Bush Set to Sign Bill; Foes Plan Court Fight
Helen Dewar 647

Partial-birth Ban Debated in Court
Amy Fagan 649

Next on Abortion: Supreme Collision
Simon Lazarus 651

U.S. Judge in San Francisco Strikes Down Federal Law Banning Form of Abortion
Adam Liptak 654

U.S. Court in New York Rejects Partial-Birth Abortion Ban
Julia Preston 657

IX. MISCELLANEOUS

Also This Term: Other Cases from the 2003-2004 Term
Synopses and Questions Presented

Reflections at the End of the 2003-2004 Term

The Year Rehnquist May Have Lost His Court
Linda Greenhouse

All Hail the Supreme Court; The Nine Justices Agree That They Know What Is Best
Stuart Taylor, Jr.

Off the Bench
Dahlia Lithwick

O'Connor Not Confined by Conservatism
Joan Biskupic