2003

2003-2004 Supreme Court Preview: Contents

Institute of Bill of Rights Law at The College of William & Mary School of Law

Repository Citation

https://scholarship.law.wm.edu/preview/157

Copyright c 2003 by the authors. This article is brought to you by the William & Mary Law School Scholarship Repository.
https://scholarship.law.wm.edu/preview
SUPREME COURT PREVIEW

What to Expect From the New Term

September 19 & 20, 2003

the Institute of Bill of Rights Law, College of William & Mary, Williamsburg, Virginia
THE INSTITUTE OF BILL OF RIGHTS LAW was established at William & Mary in 1982 to support research and education on the Constitution and the Bill of Rights. One of the principal missions of the Institute is to facilitate interaction between the professions of law and journalism. Through a discussion of key cases on the Supreme Court’s docket at the start of each term, the annual SUPREME COURT PREVIEW provides in-depth education for journalists on the underlying issues in order to enhance press coverage of the decisions.

STAFF

DAVISON M. DOUGLAS, Director, Arthur B. Hanson Professor of Law

MELODY S. NICHOLS, Program Coordinator

RYAN G. DOLAN AND ALEXANDER A. MINARD
Editors, 2003-2004 Supreme Court Preview
# 2003-2004 Supreme Court Preview

## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>I. MOOT COURT ARGUMENT</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>In This Section</em></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>New Case: 02-1315 Locke v. Davey</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Synopsis and Question Presented</strong></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Justices to Hear Religious Rights Case; Supreme Court / State of</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington, Student Battle Over Aid</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Marshall Wells and Janet I. Tu</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Justices Again Asked to Draw Church-State Line If Government</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Aid Goes to Private Education; it Must also go to Religious</em>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schools, Activists Say.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David G. Savage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Supreme Court Agrees To Decide If Scholarship Program Can</strong></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exclude Theology Students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakstone Legal &amp; Business Publishing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Courts Weighing Rights of States To Curb Aid for Religion Majors</strong></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adam Liptak</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Zelman's Future: Vouchers, Sectarian Providers, and the Next</strong></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Round of Constitutional Battles</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ira C. Lupu, Robert W. Tuttle</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Vouchers After Zelman</strong></td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Tushnet</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Costs of Denying Religious Organization The Right To Staff</strong></td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>On a Religious Basis When They Join Federal Social Service Efforts</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Taylor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
II. JUDICIAL APPOINTMENTS PROCESS

In This Section

Bush Unwavering in Push for Conservative Bench
Joan Biskupic

High Court Nominations May Hinge On Filibuster Debate; Senate
Is Divided on Constitutionality
Lyle Denniston

Bush Spurns Proposal on Court Picks; White House Rejects Democrats'
Offer to Consult on Supreme Court Nominations
David G. Savage

Getting Guns Ready for Next Nominations War
Jonathan Groner and Tony Mauro

Ideology and the Selection of Federal Judges
Erwin Chemerinsky

The Limited Nature of the Senate's Advice and Consent Role
John C. Eastman

III. AFTER LAWRENCE v. TEXAS: GAY RIGHTS IN AMERICA

In This Section

Court's Opinion on Gay Rights Reflects Trends
Joan Biskupic

A Debate on Marriage, And More, Now Looms
David Von Drehle

High Court Term Ends
Mitchell Landsberg and John M. Glionna

Ruling Seen as Precursor to Same-Sex Marriages
David G. Savage

Backers of Amendment Against Same-Sex Unions See Texas
Ruling as Boost
Stephen Dinan

Gay Unions: A matter of Rights or a Threat to Traditional Marriage?
Rick Santorum
“Don’t Ask, Don’t Tell” Faces Challenge
Rowan Scarborough 76

Scalia Jab at “Law-Profession” Culture Debated
Tony Mauro 78

Lawsuit Challenges Military’s Gay Policy
George Edmonson 81

Gay ‘Marriages’ Ahead
Cheryl Wetzstein 84

Lawyers Consider Gay Adoption Rights
Bill Rankin 89

IV. CIVIL RIGHTS/EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION

In This Section 91

NEW CASE: 02-749 Raytheon Co. v. Hernandez

Synopsis and Question Presented 93

Justices to Test Refusal to Hire Over Drug Use
David G. Savage 99

Courts Debate Rehiring Substance Abusers
Gillian Flynn 101

Justices Hear Case on Company Policy on Employees Disabled
Due to Drugs
Drug Detection Report 104

NEW CASE: 02-1080 General Dynamics Land Systems Inc. v. Cline

Synopsis and Question Presented 106

Supreme Court to Hear Reverse Age Bias Case
David G. Savage 112

Commentary: Courts Ponder Whether Young Can Benefit From ADEA
Marshall Tanick 114

ADEA – Reverse Discrimination Suits – Sixth Circuit Permits
Reverse Age Discrimination Suit Proceed
Harvard Law Review 117
NEW CASE: 02-954 Office of Independent Counsel v. Favish

Synopsis and Question Presented

Justices to Rule in Death Photos Case
David G. Savage

Should Public See Foster Death Photos?
Tony Mauro

NEW CASE: 02-9065 Muhammad v. Close

Synopsis and Question Presented

Supreme Court Accepts Appeal from Inmate
Gina Holland

Heck v. Humphrey: What Should State Prisoners Use When Seeking Damages from State Officials... Section 1983 or Federal Habeas Corpus?
Eric J. Savoy

ALSO THIS TERM

02-763 Barnhart v. Thomas
Synopsis and Question Presented

02-1205 Jones v. R.R. Donnelley & Sons Co.
Synopsis and Question Presented

V. First Amendment/Election Law

In This Section

NEW CASE: Campaign Finance Cases

Synopsis and Question Presented

Squaring Off Over Campaign Finance Suits Seem Bound for Highest Court
Marcia Coyle

Soft Money Ban is Dealt Legal Blow but Prohibition on Attack Funding Upheld
Lyle Denniston
Three-Judge Panel's 1,638-Page Decision on Campaign Finance Law Has Interest Across Political Spectrum Seeking High Court Review
Tony Mauro 151

Court to Hear Campaign Finance Arguments Sept. 8
Charles Lane 155

NEW CASE: 02-1580 Vieth v. Jubelirer

Synopsis and Question Presented 157

Supreme Court Takes Up State Redistricting
Linda Greenhouse 161

Gerrymandering and Political Cartels
Samuel Issacharoff 163

Doing Our Politics in Court: Gerrymandering, “Fair Representation” and an Exegesis into the Judicial Role
Luis Fuentes-Rohwer 165

VI. Criminal Procedure

In This Section 168

NEW CASE: 02-1060 Illinois v. Lidster

Synopsis and Question Presented 171

Justices Weigh Police Roadblocks in Crime Probes; Fairness Of Unrelated Arrests at Issue before Supreme Court
Dan Rozak 179

Lombard Case Could Affect Police Roadblocks
Robert Sanchez 180

Ruling Draws Line on Police Use of Roadblocks
Patrick J. Cotter 182

Factions Take Different Paths to Assess Roadblock
Patrick J. Cotter 186

A Better Interpretation of “Special Needs” Doctrine After Edmond and Ferguson
Jonathan Kravis 190
NEW CASE: 02-6320 Fellers v. United States

Synopsis and Question Presented

High Court to Revisit Miranda; Issue Pits Officers vs. Accused
A.J. Flick

Inmate Takes Case to High Court without Lawyer; The U.S.
Supreme Court Will Revisit Miranda in an Ex-Nebraskan’s Appeal
Robynn Tysver

It’s All in the Timing/Police Should Lean Toward Individual
Rights When Question Suspects
Opinion

Dickerson v. United States: Miranda is Deemed a Constitutional
Rule, but does it really Matter?
Conor G. Bateman

NEW CASE: 02-1183 United States v. Patane

Synopsis and Question Presented

Justices Take Case on Scope of Miranda
Charles Lane

Common Sense and Miranda Rights
Editorial

Will the High Court Revisit ‘Miranda’ – Again?
Tony Mauro

The Exclusionary Rule
Miles Clark

NEW CASE: 02-1371 Missouri v. Seibert

Synopsis and Question Presented

High Court Orders Retrial For Woman Who Wasn’t Read Rights
David Lieb

New Clamor on Right to Silence Miranda
Andrea Siegel
Right Against Self-Discrimination – Consecutive Confessions
Harvard Law Review

NEW CASE: 02-1019 Arizona v. Gant

Synopsis and Question Presented

Court Agrees to Look at Police Search Rules
AP Newswire

The Supreme Court, Criminal Procedure and Judicial Integrity
Stephen A. Saltzburg

Discretionary Warrantless Searches and Seizures and the Fourth Amendment: A Need for Clearer Guidelines
Jennifer Ison Cooke

NEW CASE: 02-809 Maryland v. Pringle

Synopsis and Question Presented

High Court to Review Traffic Stop Arrests
Anne Gearan

Without a Warrant, Probable Cause, or Reasonable Suspicion:
Is There any Meaning to the Fourth Amendment While Driving a Car?
Chris K. Visser

NEW CASE: 02-811 Groh v. Ramirez

Synopsis and Question Presented

Liability in Searches is Debated
David G. Savage

NEW CASE: 02-473 United States v. Banks

Synopsis and Question Presented

Supreme Court to Consider Police Search
Gina Holland

In The Ninth We Trust
Milton Hirsch and David Oscar Markus
Why Knock? The Door Will Inevitably Open: An Analysis of People v. Stevens and the Michigan Supreme Court’s Departure From Fourteenth Amendment Protection
Robin L. Gentry 299

NEW CASE: 02-9410 Crawford v. Washington

Synopsis and Question Presented 301

ALSO THIS TERM

02-6683 Castro v. United States
Synopsis and Question Presented 310

02-8286 Banks v. Cockrell
Synopsis and Question Presented 310

02-964 Baldwin v. Reese
Synopsis and Question Presented 311

VII. Federalism in the Rehnquist Court

In This Section 312

NEW CASE: 02-1667 Tennessee v. Lane

Synopsis and Question Presented 313

Justices to Hear Case on Whether the Disabled Can Sue States on Access to Courtrooms
Linda Greenhouse 316

Don’t Shield States from ADA Responsibilities
Editorial 318

State Immunity and the Americans with Disabilities Act After Board of Trustees of the University of Alabama v. Garrett
Ryan Gill 319

NEW CASE: 02-628 Frew v. Hawkins

Synopsis and Question Presented 324

High Court Eyes States’ Right in Lawsuits
Anne Gearan 334
VIII. Business Law

In This Section

NEW CASE: 02-658 Alaska Dep't of Environmental Conservation v. Environmental Protection Agency

Synopsis and Question Presented

Federalism Arises in Clean Air Act Case; Supreme Court to Decide if EPA's Authority Supersedes a State's
Lewis Goldshore and Marsha Wolf

Alaska and the Red Dog Mine Bite Back After the EPA Tightens The Leash
John P. Halfpenny

NEW CASE: 02-626 South Florida Water Management District v. Miccosukee Tribe of Indians

Synopsis and Question Presented

Court to Study Glades Pollution Case
St. Petersburg Times

No Permit to Pollute
Opinion

Supreme Court Docket Report
Miriam Nemetz and Robert L. Bronston

NEW CASE: 02-314 Engine Manufacturers Ass'n v. South Coast Air Quality Management District

Synopsis and Question Presented

Clean-Air Challenge to get Day in Court
David G. Savage

High Legal horsepower: U.S. Supreme Court to rule on SCAQMD Diesel Rules
Mike Osenga
NEW CASE: 02-1290 United States Postal Service v. Flamingo Industries (U.S.A.) Ltd.

Synopsis and Question Presented 385

Justices to Decide Postal Service Antitrust Case Robert Greenberger 390

ALSO THIS TERM

02-1348 Olympic Airways v. Husain Synopsis and Question Presented 392

02-1196 Securities and Exchange Commission v. Edwards Synopsis and Question Presented 392

02-819 Kontrick v. Ryan Synopsis and Question Presented 392

IX. Looking Ahead: Upcoming Issues in the Court

In This Section 393

DIRECTION OF THE COURT 396

High Court’s Course Debated After Rulings Lyle Denniston 396

A Timeout for Conservative Agenda Tony Mauro 399

Justices Take a Turn to the Left David G. Savage 403

2 Justices Influence Felt in Last Term Joan Biskupic 407

Civil Liberties Were Term’s Big Winners Charles Lane 410

At High Court, How They Rule Is a Matter of Opinion David G. Savage 414

Polls: Americans Say Court Is ‘About Right’ Charles Lane 416
PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE; Newdow v. U.S. Congress

'Under God' Underdog?
Tony Mauro

US Urges Supreme Court to Keep 'Under God' in Pledge, 'Religious Heritage' Cited By Ashcroft in Appeal of Ruling
Lyle Denniston

What's the Big Deal? The Unconstitutionality of god in the Pledge Of Allegiance
John E. Thompson

MEDICAL MARIJUANA; Conant v. Walters

9th Circuit Backs Doctors' Right to Discuss Marijuana
Jason Hoppin

White House Escalates Pot War/It Asks High Court to let Doctors be Punished
Bob Egelko

Ronald Timothy Fletcher

ASSISTED SUICIDE; Oregon v. Ashcroft

Suicide law
Laurence M. Cruz

Clash in Court Over Oregon's Law on Suicide
Tom Gorman

Federal Interference in Assisted Suicide
Editorial

Physician-Assisted Suicide and Federalism
Brian H. Bix

Physician-Assisted suicide Permits Dignity in Dying; Oregon Takes on Attorney General Ashcroft
Christina E. Manuel
SECOND AMENDMENT: RIGHT TO BEAR ARMS; 
Silveira v. Lockyer 473

S.F Court Won't Rule on Right to Bear Arms 
David Kravets 480

Explaining Constitutional Law Publicly or, Everyman's Constitution 
Philip C. Kissam 482

FILE-SHARING 487

Recording Firms Win Copyright Ruling 
Jonathan Krim 487

SBC Unit Sues RIAA Over Push to Identify Net Music Sharers 
From Associated Press 489

PARTIAL-BIRTH ABORTION 490

Judge Blocks Va. 'Partial-Birth' Abortion Ban 
Michael D. Shear 490

House Votes to Restrict Abortions 
Juliet Eilperin 492

10 COMMANDMENTS IN PUBLIC BUILDINGS; 
Glassroth v. Moore 495

Ten Commandments Monument Removal Ordered 
Bob Johnson 503

Moore Vows to Fight Ruling 
Todd Kleffman 505

WAR ON TERRORISM; Hamdi v. Rumsfeld 507

Dissent on Detention 
Editorial 513

Jailing of Hamdi Upheld As Rehearing Is Denied 
Jerry Markon 515

Padilla Kept Out of Sight, But Case is Very Visible 
Stevenson Swanson 517
U.S. Rebuked Over Padilla
Dan Mihalopoulos 520

War on Terror
Louis Fisher 523

Lawyers at War
Ruth Wedgwood 526

SCHOOL PRAYER AT THE VIRGINIA MILITARY INSTITUTE;
Mellen v. Bunting 529

Federal Court Upholds Ban on VMI Prayers
Jerry Markon 529

X. Also This Term

02-682 Verizon Communications Inc. v. Law Offices of Curtis V. Trinko LLP
Synopsis and Question Presented 531

02-693 Lamie v. U.S. Trustee
Synopsis and Question Presented 531

02-1016 Till v. SCS Credit Corp.
Synopsis and Question Presented 531

02-1405 Southwestern Bell Telephone LP v. Missouri Municipal League
Synopsis and Question Presented 532

02-1238 Nixon v. Missouri Municipal League
Synopsis and Question Presented 532

02-1386 Federal Communications Commission v. Missouri Municipal League
Synopsis and Question Presented 532

02-1389 United States v. Galletti
Synopsis and Question Presented 533

02-1377 Doe v. Chao
Synopsis and Question Presented 533

02-458 Yates v. Hendon
Synopsis and Question Presented 533

02-857 Household Credit Services Inc. v. Pfennig
Synopsis and Question Presented 534

xiii